Wyoming Law Review

Volume 5 | Number 2

Article 5

January 2005

Unmet Legal Needs in Wyoming: The Necessity to Increase the Capacity for the Public Good

Leigh Anne G. Manlove

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarship.law.uwyo.edu/wlr

Recommended Citation

Manlove, Leigh Anne G. (2005) "Unmet Legal Needs in Wyoming: The Necessity to Increase the Capacity for the Public Good," *Wyoming Law Review*: Vol. 5: No. 2, Article 5. Available at: https://scholarship.law.uwyo.edu/wlr/vol5/iss2/5

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the UW College of Law Reviews at Law Archive of Wyoming Scholarship. It has been accepted for inclusion in Wyoming Law Review by an authorized editor of Law Archive of Wyoming Scholarship.

UNMET LEGAL NEEDS IN WYOMING: THE NECESSITY TO INCREASE THE CAPACITY FOR THE PUBLIC GOOD

Leigh Anne G. Manlove*

"All courts shall be open and every person for an injury done to person, reputation or property shall have justice administered without sale, denial or delay."

The Wyoming Constitution contains broad guarantees of justice for every Wyoming citizen. However, there is a great gap between the constitutional guarantees and reality.

Article 1, section 8, of the Wyoming Constitution was applied in Kerper v. Kerper, in which the Wyoming Supreme Court held that just because litigation is costly does not make it unavailable.² However, this lofty holding does not comport with the practical, everyday reality that not every person in Wyoming has access to the courthouse or to the legal system. Kerper ignores the reality that too many citizens simply cannot afford legal representation—much less costly representation—not even for something as fundamental and important as issues regarding their own children.

THE WYOMING BAR'S VIEWPOINT

According to the bi-annual state bar survey, Wyoming attorneys believe that the most critical challenge facing our profession is the public's loss of confidence in the legal system. Following closely at number two is access to the legal system.³ These two challenges fit hand-in-glove: "What good is a lawyer if I can't get one to help me?" Our profession suffers along with those who face that more-than-rhetorical question, because the bleak reality is many Wyoming citizens do not have meaningful access to the legal system.

That reality cannot be addressed by pointing to the legal community's pro bono "obligation." Black's Law Dictionary defines pro bono as "[b]eing or involving uncompensated legal services performed especially for

^{*} Leigh Anne Manlove is Executive Director of the Wyoming State Bar Foundation, and a 2000 graduate of the University of Wyoming College of Law.

^{1.} WYO. CONST. art. 1, § 8.

Kerper v. Kerper, 819 P.2d 407, 410 (Wyo. 1991).

^{3.} UNIVERSITY OF WYOMING SURVEY RESEARCH CENTER, WYOMING STATE BAR 2003 MEMBER SURVEY 18, q. 52 (2003) (on file with the author) [hereinafter WYOMING BAR SURVEY].

the public good." Rule 6.1 of the Wyoming Rules of Professional Conduct refers to the "delivery of legal services at a substantially reduced fee," and singles out people of limited means as needing legal services at a substantially reduced rate. As explained in the comments to the Rule, "[e]very lawyer, regardless of professional prominence or professional workload, should find time to participate in or otherwise support the provision of legal services to the disadvantaged." More specifically, Wyoming lawyers "should aspire to tender at least fifty (50) hours of pro bono legal services per year."

Neither the comment nor the rule define what a substantially reduced rate is, but, as with other rules in the professional code, this determination is likely the reasonable person standard. "To thine own heart be true" might be the best guide for the lawyer as she determines what, if any, should be the reduced fee in a pro bono case. In the alternative, the Rule provides a "buy-out option," that any Wyoming lawyer may choose to "voluntarily contribute \$500.00 per year to any existing non-profit organization which provides direct legal assistance to persons of limited means "8

How closely do our peers adhere to Rule 6.1? According to the biannual bar survey, roughly 70 percent of respondents provide legal services on a monthly basis to front-end pro bono clients or clients accepted at a substantially reduced rate. Just over 5 percent choose the buy-out option. Roughly 25 percent do not accept pro bono cases and do not provide financial support for pro bono work. Among the 70 percent providing pro bono services, 12 percent provide an average of 11 or more hours per month, 24 percent provide 6 to 10 hours a month, and 34 percent provide 5 or fewer hours.

As this data indicates, almost one fourth of the Bar members are not fulfilling the ethical obligation under the professional rules relating to pro bono publico. Given the make up of the Wyoming State Bar, it is fair to assume that this group likely consists of government attorneys whose malpractice insurance does not cover work outside the scope of their job (i.e., pro bono representation) and those who may encounter employer-created prohibitions or policies that discourage or prevent pro bono work. Even so, these attorneys are failing to meet their aspirational goal by not taking advantage of the buy-out option of Rule 6.1.

^{4.} BLACK'S LAW DICTIONARY 1220 (7th ed. 1999).

Wyo. Rules of Prof'l Conduct R. 6.1(a)(2) (2003).

^{6.} Id. at R. 6.1 cmt. 3.

^{7.} Id. at R. 6.1(a).

^{8.} Id. at R. 6.1(b).

^{9.} WYOMING BAR SURVEY, supra note 3, at 22, q. 68.

^{10.} *Id*.

^{11.} Id.

Approximately ten percent of Wyoming-licensed attorneys voluntarily contribute to the annual Equal Justice Campaign, which helps support entities that provide civil legal aid to the poor. This effort, which is conducted in cooperation with the Wyoming State Bar through attorney license fee statements, generated more than \$11,000 for the 2004-2005 year. These figures, both the number of donors and the funds raised, are similar to previous years' campaigns. By contrast, the state of Texas assesses a \$65 annual Legal Services Fee on every active member of the Texas state bar. This will generate nearly \$3.5 million, and be used to improve civil and criminal legal services to the poor. 13

Wyoming lawyers cannot realistically meet all of the needs for low-income clients. Of Wyoming's 1400 resident, active attorneys, about 800 are in private practice. They do an enormous amount of the "heavy lifting" when it comes to pro bono cases. And yet thousands of our citizens cannot obtain legal representation.

CIVIL LEGAL AID TO THE POOR—A WYOMING PRIMER

Where can a low-income person with a legal issue go for help? Limited income in no way limits the kinds of legal problems that low-income people may face, which may include consumer issues, housing, family law, public benefits, employment, health, education, disability, wills and estates, tort defense and immigration. In Wyoming, public resources that can meet these needs are extremely limited.

Civil legal aid to the poor is federally funded in all fifty states and the District of Columbia. The agency that distributes those funds on a competitive basis is the Legal Services Corporation (LSC). LSC is a private, non-profit corporation established by Congress in 1974 to assure equal access to justice under the law for all Americans. It is administered by a bipartisan Board of Directors appointed by the President and confirmed by the Senate.

Wyoming's share of LSC funding was \$622,625 in 2004 (based on a poverty population of 55,000 people) to fund our state's LSC program, Wyoming Legal Services (WLS). WLS employs between 8 and 10 attorneys, with offices in Cheyenne, Casper, and Lander, and is required to serve the entire state and the Wind River Indian reservation. WLS case priorities

^{12.} McGee, Hearne & Paiz, LLC, Wyoming State Bar 2004 Financial Audit 11 (2004) (on file with the author).

^{13.} TEX. ST. BAR, STATUS REPORT—CIVIL SERVICES TO THE POOR IN TEXAS (Sept. 8, 2004), available at http://www.texasbar.com/Content/NavigationMenu/Professional_Requirements/For_Attorneys/Dues1/Legal_Services_Fee/Legal_Services_Fee.htm (last visited May 13, 2005).

^{14. 42} U.S.C. § 2996 (2004).

include Wind River Indian Reservation impact litigation, public benefits, domestic violence, divorces, utilities, landlord/tenant, and consumer debt. The extent of services provided by WLS is limited by client income requirements and WLS case priorities.

There are two other legal aid providers in Wyoming. One is the University of Wyoming College of Law Legal Services Program and Domestic Violence Legal Assistance Project, which primarily serves three counties and the state's correctional institutions. The law school clinics have the same income guidelines as WLS. The other Wyoming legal aid provider is the Wyoming Coalition Against Domestic Violence & Sexual Assault, which does not have income requirements, but can only serve domestic violence and sexual assault victims whose civil legal issues stem from the abuse. There are fewer than twenty legal aid attorneys in Wyoming.

The client population that may need to utilize the services of legal aid attorneys is nearly 75,000. In Wyoming, almost one in six people lives at or below 125 percent of the federal poverty level, 15 which is the national standard used by WLS and the University of Wyoming College of Law's Legal Services Programs. 16 In real terms, this means that a family of four with an income above \$1900 per month is too "rich" to qualify for legal aid. The 75,000 residents who are income eligible must also have cases that fall within the guidelines of these programs in order to qualify.

Because the federal government has an obligation to fund civil legal aid to the poor, the states have a similar responsibility. Child poverty in Wyoming is increasing.¹⁷ Nearly nine percent of our aged population lives below the federal poverty level,¹⁸ and yet Wyoming is one of only ten states that do not provide funding for civil legal aid to the poor. This leaves tens of thousands of our citizens, including children and the elderly, alone as they face crushing legal issues like homelessness, disability and neglect.

The legal aid clinics at the law school have a waiting list; it is approximately twelve months for the Legal Services Program and several

^{15.} U.S. CENSUS BUREAU, CPS 2004 ANNUAL SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC SUPPLEMENT, table POV46, available at http://pubdb3.census.gov/macro/032004/pov/new46_100125_01.htm (last visited May 17, 2005) [hereinafter CPS SUPPLEMENT].

^{16.} For example, a family of 4 is income ineligible if its annual income is more than \$23,000. U.S. CENSUS BUREAU, POVERTY THRESHOLDS 2004, available at http://www.census.gov/hhes/poverty/threshld/thresh04.html (last visited May 17, 2005).

^{17.} NATIONAL CENTER FOR CHILDREN IN POVERTY, COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY MAILMAN SCHOOL OF PUBLIC HEALTH, WYOMING DEMOGRAPHICS, at http://www.nccp.org/state_detail_demo-graphic_WY.htm (last visited May 17, 2005).

^{18.} U.S. CENSUS BUREAU, PROFILE OF SELECTED ECONOMIC CHARACTERISTICS 2000, available at http://factfinder.census.gov/servlet/QTTable?_bm=n&_lang=en&qr_name=DEC_2000_SF3_U_DP3&ds_name=DEC_2000_SF3_U&geo_id=04000US56 (last visited May 18, 2005).

weeks for the Domestic Violence Legal Assistance Project.¹⁹ In contrast, WLS does not have a waiting list because if it cannot provide service to a person, it is forced to turn him or her away.

What do these numbers mean? There are not enough lawyers or legal aid programs to fill the unmet legal needs. These numbers do not address members of the population who are above the 125 percent federal poverty level threshold and are financially unable to hire an attorney. Placing a number on this group is difficult, as there is not available data to define it.

A CALL TO (LEGAL) ACTION

Now is the time for Wyoming attorneys to educate first themselves and then the public about the unmet legal need that exists in our state. Our profession must ask who is in need; what is the nature of the legal need; why are those legal needs unmet; and what can and should be done about it? Answers to those questions will help educate the public, for without the public's support, expanding civil legal aid to the poor will not be realized.

Wyomingites who lead comfortable middle-class lives have no appreciation of the grim financial reality faced by many Wyoming families. Imagine if your monthly housing payment was almost double your monthly income, despite working nearly eighty hours a week. For thousands of people in our state, this is a reality.

The recently released annual report of the National Low Income Housing Coalition²⁰ reports that a Wyoming minimum wage earner can afford monthly rent of no more than \$268 and must work seventy-eight hours per week to afford a two-bedroom unit at the state's fair market rent of \$523 per month.²¹ The housing wage in Wyoming is \$10.06 per hour.²² This represents the amount a full time (forty hours per week) worker must earn per hour in order to afford a two-bedroom unit.

Nearly 55,000 people in Wyoming are considered extremely low income.²³ These households, which have a yearly income of \$16,643, can

^{19.} UNIV. OF WYO. COLLEGE OF LAW, 2005 WYOMING STATE BAR FOUNDATION IOLTA GRANT APPLICATION (July 15, 2004) (on file with author).

^{20.} The National Low Income Housing Coalition, established in 1974, is dedicated solely to ending America's affordable housing crisis. NLIHC educates, organizes and advocates to ensure decent, affordable housing within healthy neighborhoods for everyone. NLIHC provides up-to-date information, formulates policy, and educates the public on housing needs and the strategies for solutions. See generally http://www.nlihc.org/oor2004/data.php?getstate-on&state%5B%5D-WY (last visited May 17, 2005).

^{21.} See id.

^{22.} See id.

^{23.} U.S. CENSUS BUREAU, WYOMING QUICK FACTS, at http://quickfacts.census.gov/qfd/states/56000.html (last revised Feb. 21, 2005).

afford monthly rent of no more than \$416,²⁴ and an individual on Social Security Insurance who receives \$564 per month can afford monthly rent of no more than \$169.²⁵

More than 5,000 Wyoming families live below the poverty level where the head of the household is a female with no husband present.²⁶ Among these women, 38 percent have children under eighteen years of age.²⁷ When the single mother does not receive her child support payment or is denied a public benefit, like Title 19 health insurance or food stamps, the end result is that she and her family are at risk of becoming homeless.

It is at this point where the assistance of an attorney is critical, but the person in need of legal help is least able to afford it. Corrective legal measures, like obtaining court-ordered child support or appealing the denial of a public benefit, can make the difference between a family being able to pay its rent or being evicted.

GROWTH OF THE PRO SE PARTY

The limited civil legal aid that is available, coupled with the high demand for services, has resulted in a growing trend where low-income individuals resort to representing themselves in court. Referred to as pro se litigants, these self-helpers are held to the same standards as attorneys, although they lack the legal education and training to competently represent themselves.

Imagine, if you will, the following scenario which occurs far too often in courtrooms around our state. Mom and dad are divorcing, pro se, and child custody and child support are at issue. The divorce is acrimonious and neither parent has the means to hire an attorney. Additionally, the children who are caught up in the situation do not have attorneys or a guardian ad litem appointed to ensure that their best interests are represented. The court documents are a mess; information is inaccurate, incomplete and missing; paperwork is improperly filed and served. And if you think reality television is bad, you should sit in a courtroom and listen to the arguments of the pro se parties in a case like this.

^{24.} To access this and other data for Wyoming and other states, see NATIONAL LOW INCOME HOUSING COALITION ANNUAL REPORT, OUT OF REACH 2004, available at www.nlihc.org/oor2004 (last visited May 4, 2005).

^{25.} Id.

^{26.} U.S. CENSUS BUREAU, PROFILE OF SELECTED ECONOMIC CHARACTERISTICS 2000, WYOMING, available at http://factfinder.census.gov/servlet/QTTable?_bm=n&_lang=en&qr_name=DEC_2000_SF3_U_DP3&ds_name=DEC_2000_SF3_U&geo_id=04000US56 (last visited May 18, 2005).

^{27.} Id.

As compassionate people living in a democracy we should be ashamed that our legal system has come to this. As attorneys, we should be emboldened to do something about it.

Much of the discussion about the unmet legal need in our state and our country focuses on extremely low-income people. However, that focus ignores another segment of our population, the working poor, who make just enough to get by but do not have the financial resources to hire an attorney.

MEASURING OUR CHARACTER USING THE BUDGET AS THE RULER

In a recent editorial, the Washington Post urged its readers to remember the poor during the current Congressional budget process.²⁸ The Post reported that the number of Americans living in poverty is increasing: one out of every eight Americans is poor and a disproportionate number of those people are children; the number of uninsured has never been higher; hunger has increased and the poorest among us fell further below the poverty line.²⁹ These facts are important, urged the Post, because in light of them the national budget becomes a measure of the national character.³⁰ It has often been observed that the true mark of a country is how it treats the poor and helpless.

In this regard, Wyoming does not measure up. There are not sufficient resources available to the people of Wyoming who have serious civil legal issues but cannot afford an attorney.³¹ Currently, Wyoming is one of only ten states that do not fund civil legal aid to the poor.

During the 2005 legislative session, the Wyoming legislature approved and funded a new guardian ad litem (GAL) law that will ensure that abused or neglected children have legal representation.³² Bill sponsor and Wyoming attorney Senator John Hanes estimates 750 cases per year will meet the statutory requirements.³³ The new law, which becomes effective July 1, 2005, will reimburse attorneys providing legal representation as guardians ad litem in child protection cases,³⁴ children in need of supervision

^{28.} Editorial, Remember the Poor, WASH. POST, Feb. 7, 2005, at A20.

^{29.} Id.

^{30.} Id.

^{31.} As of the writing of this article, the ten states that do not currently fund civil legal aid to the poor include: Alabama, Alaska, Arkansas, Colorado, Connecticut, Idaho, Mississippi, South Dakota, Wisconsin and Wyoming. Alaska and Colorado eliminated state funding in 2004 due to budget woes. See ABA Project to Expand Resources for Legal Services, at www.abanet.org/legalservices/sclaid/-nosearch/perlsmembers (last visited May 4, 2005).

^{32.} H.B. 314, 58th Leg., Gen. Sess. (Wyo. 2005) (effective date July 1, 2005) (authorizing and appropriating \$2.1 million to train and pay GALs in neglect and abuse cases), available at http://legisweb.state.wy.us/2005/enroll/hb0314.pdf.

^{33.} Ilene Olson, Panel OKs Money to Train Attorneys to Help Children, WYO. TRIB.-EAGLE, Feb. 26, 2005, at 7.

^{34.} H.B. 314, 58th Leg., Gen. Sess. (Wyo. 2005), available at http://legisweb.state.wy.us/

cases,³⁵ or termination of parental rights actions brought as a result of a child protection or children in need of supervision action.³⁶

Additionally, the legislation requires that attorneys seeking reimbursement meet standards set by the Board of Judicial Policy and Administration.³⁷ Counties will be required to match a minimum of twenty-five percent of the state funds.³⁸ The Wyoming Supreme Court is charged with the distribution of the funding and is authorized one full-time administrative position to run the program.³⁹ While this legislation is important, it is only a first small step in a very long, up-hill trek.

What will happen to the abused and neglected children who cannot access the legal system and gain the protection of the GAL legislation? For example, in an adjudicated child custody case if one parent is being denied visitation rights (to the child's detriment), that parent must be able to access the courts before the child can receive the benefits of a GAL. If that parent does not have the financial resources to retain an attorney in the post-decree matter, the case will never be heard and the child's best interests will not be represented despite the intent of the law.

MEETING THE UNMET LEGAL NEED - SOLUTIONS FOR THE PROBLEM

The American Bar Association's 1994 Comprehensive Legal Needs Study found that in a twelve-month period, forty-seven percent of low-income households faced at least one legal need and among moderate-income households the figure was fifty-two percent.⁴⁰ The need for civil legal services in Wyoming has never been systematically investigated or quantified; this kind of assessment would be an important foundation for addressing access to justice issues.

Even without a Wyoming-specific legal needs assessment, data from the ABA's and other state's studies can be extrapolated to our state's population. Using the most rudimentary math and basing calculations on the low range of numbers, in Wyoming there are approximately 27,500 low-income people who have a legal issue. There is no shortage of clients for the state's legal aid attorneys.

2005/enroll/hb0314.pdf.

^{35.} Id.

^{36.} Id.

^{37.} *Id*.

^{38.} *Id*.

^{39.} Id

^{40.} AMERICAN BAR ASSOCIATION, LEGAL NEEDS AND CIVIL JUSTICE (March, 1994), available at http://www.abanet.org/legalservices/downloads/sclaid/legalneedstudy.pdf.

Public education about this problem is the first place to begin. People believe that fundamental fairness should be the guiding principle of what happens in our legal system⁴¹ and there is nothing fair about not being able to afford an attorney or having to represent yourself, especially if the opposing party has representation.

There is a misperception that if someone needs an attorney, one will be appointed. This is true in a criminal case; a defendant has a right to an attorney, and if he cannot afford one, Wyoming's excellent public defender system will represent him. This is a well-known fact among the general public, thanks in large part to the media. However, people are surprised to learn that there is no such right in civil cases, like divorce, child custody or support, and consumer issues. The irony is that the issues at stake in a civil case are just as important as they are in a criminal case.

The civic health of our communities is directly reflected in the public's ability to access the courts. There is as much of a legal crisis in our state as health care providers advocate that there is a medical crisis. The difference between the two—there is no legal equivalent to the emergency room.

Of single greatest importance is increasing the capacity of the legal system to meet the need. A profound and immediate impact would be achieved if three things were implemented. First, Wyoming must dedicate state funding for civil legal aid to the poor, beginning with a legal needs study to ensure that such funding would be utilized to best address existing needs. Second, a loan repayment program that would place legal aid lawyers in Wyoming's communities (similar to the models used with doctors and teachers) could be created using state funds and federal LSC monies. Third, a progressive and adaptive approach to pro se litigants, like that used in California or Arizona, should be adopted.

State funding to support civil legal aid to the poor can take many different forms, not just an appropriation in the state budget process, although that must be the starting point.

The Wyoming legislature could require that people who file lawsuits pay an additional court fee, ranging from \$2 in the lower courts to \$25 in the Supreme Court, directing those fees to nonprofit organizations that provide free civil legal services to low-income Wyomingites.

^{41.} *Id*.

^{42.} This statement is based on the author's anecdotal experience in running the Wyoming Volunteer Lawyers Program, fielding inquiries from the public at the Wyoming State Bar office and speaking to people around the state.

The Wyoming Supreme Court should require that the funds generated from out-of-state lawyers' fees be dedicated to civil legal aid to the poor. Wyoming's pro hac vice rule provides that for each case in which an applicant seeks admission, a \$250 fee must be paid to the Wyoming State Bar.⁴³ Currently, the monies generated by pro hac vice fees go to the Wyoming State Bar's general fund.

The Wyoming State Bar should continue to support the Bar Foundation through its current in-kind contributions, the Equal Justice Campaign, and events at the Annual Meeting & Judicial Council. Additionally, the Wyoming State Bar should increase its support of access to justice initiatives and programs by funding a staff position dedicated to those issues.

Judicial leadership must focus on the issue of unmet legal need and place it at the top of the list of priorities. Wyoming is among a handful of states that does not have a task force addressing the issue. The judiciary should reach out to the twenty-five percent of the Bar that is not meeting its pro bono responsibilities and encourage those attorneys to either donate their professional services or dig into their pockets. Compelling attorneys to think about their commitment to pro bono work can be accomplished by implementing a mandatory pro bono reporting rule (not mandatory performance of pro bono) in the professional conduct rules. In the daily operation of the courts, judges can stress the importance of pro bono work and encourage it by accommodating those cases on the docket and granting in forma pauperis motions.

The groups and agencies that are already serving our low and moderate income communities need to be enlisted in the effort to solve unmet legal needs. This would create a holistic approach and utilize not only social service agencies like the Department of Family Services, but the faith-based community, law enforcement and the health care profession.

CONCLUSION

It is critically important to remember that the numbers and statistics in this article represent real people: your neighbor or the children who go to school with your children or the people with whom you work. The outcome of their legal challenges will impact not only their lives, but our communities as well, because a family's safety, health, stability, education, food or financial solvency is dependent upon an effective solution to their legal problems.⁴⁴

^{43.} Wyo. BAR Ass'n Org. & Gov't R. 11 (2004).

^{44.} LAWYER'S TRUST FUND, THE LEGAL AID SAFETY NET: A REPORT ON THE LEGAL NEEDS OF LOW-INCOME ILLINOISANS (February 2005), available at www.ltf.org/legal-needs.htm.

As lawyers, we have a great obligation to solve the problem of unmet legal needs. As a state, we face the enormous responsibility of improving the lives of the under-served and disadvantaged among us. Every one of them deserves their own champion—an attorney who will honorably advocate on their behalf.

One fine example of a Wyoming attorney who is quietly making a difference in his community is Larry Jorgenson, who practices law in Jackson. "I'm very proud of my profession, not because of big cases, but because of the opportunity to help people from all walks of life—particularly with those who have less capability of taking care of themselves."

In the end, Larry's sentiment reflects why *pro bono publico* is so important. Just ask someone who needs a lawyer but cannot afford one.